T-593 P.004/005 F-478 Page 2 of 3

U.S. Serial No. 10/054,228

Reply to Office Action of: 02/23/2004

Family Number: P2001J067

## **Remarks**

Applicants' claimed invention requires introducing a regenerated but not reactivated catalyst into a HCS slurry reactor operating at HCS slurry process conditions and containing catalyst rejuvenation means.

Pedrick discloses rejuvenating (not activating) a reversibly deactivated catalyst by treating the catalyst with hydrogen in a slurry phase reactor. Because Pedrick does not disclose introducing a regenerated but not reactivated catalyst into an HCS reactor as required by applicants' claims, Pedrick fails to anticipate applicants' invention and the rejection under 35 USC 102(b) should be withdrawn.

The Examiner's reliance on the fact that both Pedrick's and applicants' reactor has catalyst rejuvenation means is misplaced. The similarities between the reactors are not controlling. It is what is done in the reactor that is different.

All the art cited by the Examiner supports applicants' position that only reversibly deactivated catalysts can be rejuvenated, i.e., reactivated without regeneration.

Applicants demonstrated in the instant application that freshly prepared catalyst has to be activated outside of the HCS reactor to become fully activated.

Therefore, there is absolutely no reason why a person with ordinary skill in the art would expect that a regenerated catalyst could be activated in an HCS slurry reactor having catalyst rejuvenation means.

Page 3 of 3

U.S. Serial No. 10/054,228

Reply to Office Action of: 02/23/2004

Family Number: P2001J067

In view of the foregoing, applicants submit that the claims in issue are patentable over the art of record and they request the Examiner to pass the case to issue.

Respectfully submitted,

Estelle C. Bakun

Attorney for Applicant(s) Registration No. 35,054

Telephone Number: (908) 730-3635 Facsimile Number: (908) 730-3649

X Pursuant to 37 CFR 1.34(a)

ExxonMobil Research and Engineering Company P. O. Box 900 Annandale, New Jersey 08801-0900

JJD:jdw 3/16/04